

# Functional Limits and Continuity

## 4.1. Functional Limits

**Definition 4.1** ( $\epsilon$ - $\delta$  definition of functional limits). Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and let  $c$  be a limit point of the domain  $A$ . We say the limit of  $f$  as  $x$  approaches  $c$  is a number  $L$  and write  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$  provided that, for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that whenever  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$  and  $x \in A$  it follows that  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$ .

Note that the condition  $0 < |x - c|$  is simply saying  $x \neq c$ . Therefore, as known from Calculus, the limit value  $L$  has nothing to do with whether  $f$  is defined at  $c$  or not; even  $f(c)$  is defined (meaning  $c \in A$ ),  $L$  may not have any relation with it.

**EXAMPLE 4.1.** (i) Let  $f(x) = 3x + 1$ . In this case the domain  $A$  of this formula-defined function is considered to be all real numbers, that certainly makes sense of  $f(x)$ . Show  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 2} f(x) = 7$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\epsilon > 0$ . We need to produce a  $\delta > 0$  with the property that  $|f(x) - 7| < \epsilon$  holds for all  $x$  satisfying  $0 < |x - 2| < \delta$ . The ending requirement is the inequality  $|f(x) - 7| < \epsilon$ , which can be rewritten as

$$|f(x) - 7| = |(3x + 1) - 7| = |3x - 6| = 3|x - 2| < \epsilon.$$

Hence the requirement  $|f(x) - 7| < \epsilon$  is equivalent to  $|x - 2| < \epsilon/3$ ; that is, whenever  $|x - 2| < \epsilon/3$ , it follows that  $|f(x) - 7| < \epsilon$ . Therefore, we can select simply  $\delta = \epsilon/3 > 0$  to satisfy the definition.  $\square$

(ii) Show  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 2} x^2 = 4$ .

**Proof.** Given  $\epsilon > 0$ , our goal is to produce a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $|x^2 - 4| < \epsilon$  for all  $x$  with  $0 < |x - 2| < \delta$ . As above the domain set  $A = \mathbf{R}$ . We start to analyze the ending requirement  $|x^2 - 4| < \epsilon$ , which can be rewritten as

$$|x^2 - 4| = |x + 2||x - 2| < \epsilon.$$

Unlike the previous example, in front of  $|x - 2|$  there is a function  $|x + 2|$ , not simply a constant number; we cannot divide by  $|x + 2|$  to simply select  $\delta = \epsilon/|x + 2|$  since this  $\delta$

depends on  $x$ . The idea is to first choose one fixed  $\delta$  to control the term  $|x+2|$ . For example, let  $|x-2| < 1$  (with  $\delta_1 = 1$ ). For all such  $x$ 's, we have  $-1 < x-2 < 1$  and hence  $1 < x < 3$  and so  $3 < x+2 < 5$ ; that is,  $|x+2| < 5$ . Hence, if  $|x-2| < 1$  then  $|x+2| < 5$  and so

$$|x^2 - 4| = |x+2||x-2| \leq 5|x-2| \quad (\text{note that this inequality holds when } |x-2| < 1).$$

Therefore, for all such  $x$ 's, to make  $|x^2 - 4| < \epsilon$ , it suffices to require  $|x-2| < \epsilon/5 = \delta_2$ .

Now, choose  $\delta = \min\{1, \epsilon/5\}$ . If  $0 < |x-2| < \delta$ , then both  $|x-2| < \delta_1 = 1$  and  $|x-2| < \delta_2 = \epsilon/5$  hold and hence

$$|x^2 - 4| = |x+2||x-2| \leq 5|x-2| < 5 \times \frac{\epsilon}{5} = \epsilon,$$

and the limit is proved.  $\square$

**Topological Version of Functional Limits.** Since the statement  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  is equivalent to  $f(x) \in V_\epsilon(L)$  and the statement  $|x - c| < \delta$  is equivalent to  $x \in V_\delta(c)$  and hence the statement  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$  and  $x \in A$  simply means  $x \in (V_\delta(c) \setminus \{c\}) \cap A$ , we can rephrase the  $\epsilon$ - $\delta$  definition above by using the topological terminologies (of neighborhoods).

**Definition 4.2 (Topological Definition of Functional Limits).** Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and let  $c$  be a limit point of the domain  $A$ . We say  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$  provided that

$$\forall \epsilon > 0 \quad \exists \delta > 0, \quad f(\hat{V}_\delta(c) \cap A) \subseteq V_\epsilon(L),$$

where  $\hat{V}_\delta(c) = V_\delta(c) \setminus \{c\}$  denotes the **punctured neighborhood** of  $c$ .

**Sequential Criterion for Functional Limits.** Functional limits can be completely characterized by the convergence of all related sequences.

**Theorem 4.1 (Sequential Criterion for Functional Limits).** Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c$  be a limit point of  $A$ . Then the following two conditions are equivalent:

(i)  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$ .

(ii) For all sequences  $(x_n)$  satisfying  $x_n \in A$ ,  $x_n \neq c$  and  $(x_n) \rightarrow c$ , it follows that the sequence  $(f(x_n)) \rightarrow L$ .

**Proof.** 1. First assume (i) and we prove (ii). Let  $(x_n)$  satisfy  $x_n \in A$ ,  $x_n \neq c$  and  $(x_n) \rightarrow c$ . Given each  $\epsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists \delta > 0$  such that  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  for all  $x \in A$  with  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$ . For this  $\delta > 0$ ,  $\exists N \in \mathbf{N}$  such that  $|x_n - c| < \delta$  for all  $n \geq N$  in  $\mathbf{N}$ . Since  $x_n \neq c$ , we have  $0 < |x_n - c| < \delta$  for all  $n \geq N$  and thus  $|f(x_n) - L| < \epsilon$ . This proves  $(f(x_n)) \rightarrow L$ .

2. We now assume (ii) and prove (i). Suppose  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) \neq L$ . Then  $\exists \epsilon_0 > 0$ ,  $x_n \in A$  with  $0 < |x_n - c| < 1/n$  but  $|f(x_n) - L| \geq \epsilon_0$  for all  $n = 1, 2, \dots$ . (This is the **negation** of  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$ .) For this sequence  $(x_n)$ , by (ii),  $(f(x_n)) \rightarrow L$ , a contradiction to  $|f(x_n) - L| \geq \epsilon_0$  for all  $n = 1, 2, \dots$ .  $\square$

**Corollary 4.2 (Divergence Criterion for Functional Limits).** Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c$  be a limit point of  $A$ . If there exist two sequences  $(x_n)$  and  $(y_n)$  in  $A$ , with  $x_n \neq c$  and  $y_n \neq c$ , satisfying the property

$$\lim x_n = \lim y_n = c \quad \text{but} \quad \lim f(x_n) \neq \lim f(y_n),$$

then the functional limit  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x)$  does not exist.

EXAMPLE 4.2. Show that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 0} \sin(1/x)$  does not exist.

**Proof.** Let  $x_n = 1/2n\pi$  and  $y_n = 1/(2n\pi + \pi/2)$  for all  $n \in \mathbf{N}$ . Then  $x_n \neq 0$  and  $y_n \neq 0$  and  $\lim x_n = \lim y_n = 0$ . But  $\sin(1/x_n) = \sin(2n\pi) = 0$  while  $\sin(1/y_n) = \sin(2n\pi + \pi/2) = \sin(\pi/2) = 1$ . By the corollary above, the functional limit  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 0} \sin(1/x)$  does not exist.  $\square$

**Theorem 4.3 (Algebraic Limit Theorem for Functional Limits).** *Let  $f, g: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c$  be a limit point of  $A$ . Assume  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$  and  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x) = M$  exist. Then*

- (i)  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} [af(x) + bg(x)] = aL + bM$  for all  $a, b \in \mathbf{R}$ ,
- (ii)  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} [f(x)g(x)] = LM$ ,
- (iii)  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} [f(x)/g(x)] = L/M$ , provided  $M \neq 0$ .

## 4.2. Combinations of Continuous Functions

**Definition 4.3 (Continuous Functions).** Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c \in A$ .

(i) We say  $f$  is **continuous at a point**  $c \in A$  if, for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that whenever  $|x - c| < \delta$  and  $x \in A$  it follows that  $|f(x) - f(c)| < \epsilon$ .

If  $f$  is not continuous at  $c$  we say  $f$  is **discontinuous** at  $c$ .

(ii) We say  $f$  is a **continuous function** on  $A$  if it is continuous at every point in  $A$ .

Note that continuity at  $c$  is not defined if  $f(c)$  is not defined, i.e., if  $c \notin A$ . If  $c \in A$  is an *isolated point* of  $A$ , then  $f$  is *always* continuous at  $c$  since for some  $\delta > 0$  the only point  $x$  satisfying  $|x - c| < \delta$  and  $x \in A$  is  $x = c$  and hence the condition  $|f(x) - f(c)| = 0 < \epsilon$  always holds. If  $c \in A$  is a limit point of  $A$ , then continuity of  $f$  at  $c$  is simply equivalent to

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = f(c).$$

This is the most interesting case.

**Theorem 4.4 (Characterizations of Continuity).** *Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c \in A$  be a limit point of  $A$ . Then the following conditions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $f$  is continuous at  $c$ .
- (ii)  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = f(c)$ .
- (iii)  $\forall \epsilon > 0 \exists \delta > 0, f(V_\delta(c) \cap A) \subseteq V_\epsilon(f(c))$ .
- (iv) Whenever  $x_n \in A$  and  $(x_n) \rightarrow c$  it follows that  $(f(x_n)) \rightarrow f(c)$ .

**Proof.** (i), (ii), and (iii) are simply a different way to describe the definition of the continuity; the condition (iv) with  $x_n \neq c$  would be already equivalent to the convergence  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = f(c)$ . Details are omitted.  $\square$

**Corollary 4.5 (Criterion for Discontinuity).** *Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c \in A$  be a limit point of  $A$ . Then  $f$  is not continuous at  $c$  if and only if for some number  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  and sequence  $(x_n)$  in  $A$  with  $(x_n) \rightarrow c$  it follows that  $|f(x_n) - f(c)| \geq \epsilon_0$  for all  $n \in \mathbf{N}$ .*

**Proof.** Use Theorem 4.4 with  $\neg(ii) \iff \neg(iv)$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 4.6 (Algebraic Continuity Theorem).** *Let  $f, g: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be continuous at a point  $c \in A$ . Then*

- (i)  $af(x) + bg(x)$  is continuous at  $c$  for all  $a, b \in \mathbf{R}$ ;
- (ii)  $f(x)g(x)$  is continuous at  $c$ ;
- (iii)  $f(x)/g(x)$  is continuous at  $c$ , provided the quotient is well defined.

**Corollary 4.7.** *Polynomials are all continuous functions on  $\mathbf{R}$ . Furthermore, all rational functions (quotients of polynomials) are continuous at points where the denominator is not zero.*

EXAMPLE 4.3. Let

$$g(x) = \begin{cases} x \sin(1/x) & \text{if } x \neq 0 \\ 0 & \text{if } x = 0. \end{cases}$$

Then  $g$  is continuous at 0.

**Proof.** Note that  $|g(x)| \leq |x|$  for all  $x \in \mathbf{R}$ ; this is clearly true if  $x = 0$  and is also true if  $x \neq 0$  by the formula of  $g(x)$  since  $|\sin \theta| \leq 1$  for all  $\theta$ . Given each  $\epsilon > 0$ , let  $\delta = \epsilon$ . Then, whenever  $|x - 0| < \delta$ , since  $g(0) = 0$ ,

$$|g(x) - g(0)| = |g(x)| \leq |x| < \delta = \epsilon.$$

So  $g$  is continuous at 0. □

EXAMPLE 4.4. Function  $f(x) = \sqrt{x}$  is continuous on  $A = \{x \in \mathbf{R} : x \geq 0\} = [0, \infty)$ . This can be shown by the definition directly or using the sequential criterion.

**Theorem 4.8 (Composition of Continuous Functions).** *Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g: B \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , where  $B \supseteq f(A)$  and so that the **composition function**  $g \circ f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is defined by  $g \circ f(x) = g(f(x))$  for  $x \in A$ . Then, if  $f$  is continuous at a point  $c \in A$  and  $g$  is continuous at  $f(c) \in B$ ,  $g \circ f$  is continuous at  $c \in A$  as well.*

**Proof.** Given  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\tau > 0$  such that

$$|g(y) - g(f(c))| < \epsilon \quad \forall y \in B, |y - f(c)| < \tau.$$

With this  $\tau > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$|f(x) - f(c)| < \tau \quad \forall x \in A, |x - c| < \delta.$$

Therefore, whenever  $x \in A$  and  $|x - c| < \delta$ , it follows that  $f(x) \in B$  and  $|f(x) - f(c)| < \tau$ , and hence

$$|g \circ f(x) - g \circ f(c)| = |g(f(x)) - g(f(c))| < \epsilon.$$

Hence, by definition,  $g \circ f$  is continuous at  $c$ . □

### 4.3. Continuous Functions on Compact Sets and Uniform Continuity

**Definition 4.4.** A function  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is said to be **bounded on a set**  $B \subseteq A$  if the set  $f(B)$  is a bounded set. If  $f(A)$  is a bounded set, we say  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is a **bounded function**.

**Theorem 4.9 (Preservation of Compact Sets).** *Let  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be continuous on  $A$ . If  $K \subseteq A$  is a compact set, then  $f(K)$  is compact as well.*

**Proof.** Given any sequence  $(y_n)$  in  $f(K)$ , we show that there exists a subsequence  $(y_{n_k})$  converging to some limit  $y \in f(K)$ . This will prove that  $f(K)$  is compact. Since  $y_n \in f(K)$ , we have  $y_n = f(x_n)$  for some  $x_n \in K$ . Now  $(x_n)$  is sequence contained in  $K$ . Since  $K$  is compact, there exists a subsequence  $(x_{n_k})$  converging to a limit  $x \in K$ . By the continuity,  $(f(x_{n_k})) \rightarrow f(x)$ . Since  $y_{n_k} = f(x_{n_k})$ , we have  $(y_{n_k}) \rightarrow y = f(x) \in f(K)$ . This proves that  $f(K)$  is compact. □

**Remark 4.1.** In contrast to this theorem, continuous functions do not preserve bounded sets, open sets or closed sets. Consider the following examples.

(i) Function  $f(x) = 1/x$  is continuous on  $(0, \infty)$ , and maps bounded set  $(0, 1)$  to unbounded set  $(1, \infty)$ . This function also maps closed interval  $A = [1, \infty)$  to the set  $f(A) = (0, 1]$ , which is not closed.

(ii) Function  $f(x) = x^2$  is continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ , and maps the open set  $A = (-1, 1)$  to the set  $f(A) = [0, 1)$ , which is not open.

**Theorem 4.10 (Extreme Value Theorem).** *If  $f: K \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is continuous on a compact set  $K \subseteq \mathbf{R}$ , then  $f$  attains its maximum and minimum values; namely, there exist numbers  $x_*, x^* \in K$  such that  $f(x_*) \leq f(x) \leq f(x^*)$  for all  $x \in K$ .*

**Proof.** We only prove the maximum case. Let  $A = f(K)$ . Then  $A$  is compact; hence  $A$  is bounded and closed. Let  $M = \sup A$ . Then  $f(x) \leq M$  for all  $x \in K$ . We now show that there exists a number  $x^* \in K$  such that  $f(x^*) = M$ , which proves that the maximum is attained. Since  $M = \sup A$ , for each  $n \in \mathbf{N}$ , there exists a number  $y_n \in A$  such that  $y_n > M - \frac{1}{n}$  (which just states that  $M - \frac{1}{n}$  is not an upper-bound for  $A$ ). Since  $y_n \leq M$ , this implies  $(y_n) \rightarrow M$ . Now, since  $y_n \in A = f(K)$  and  $A$  is compact, by definition of compact sets,  $(y_n)$  has a convergent subsequence whose limit is in  $A$ , but this subsequence also converges to  $M$ ; therefore,  $M \in A = f(K)$ , which means that there exists a number  $x^* \in K$  such that  $M = f(x^*)$ .  $\square$

### Uniform Continuity.

**Definition 4.5.** A function  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is said to be **uniformly continuous on  $A$**  if, for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that whenever  $x, y \in A$  and  $|x - y| < \delta$  it follows that  $|f(x) - f(y)| < \epsilon$ .

**Remark 4.2.** We only talk about the uniform continuity of a function *on a given set* not *at a point*. From the definition, we see that every uniformly continuous function on a set  $A$  must be continuous at every point of  $A$  and so must be a continuous function on  $A$ .

EXAMPLE 4.5. Show that  $f(x) = 3x + 1$  is uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ .

**Proof.** Since  $f(x) - f(y) = 3(x - y)$ , given each  $\epsilon > 0$ , letting  $\delta = \epsilon/3$ , it follows that whenever  $|x - y| < \delta$ ,

$$|f(x) - f(y)| = 3|x - y| < 3\delta = \epsilon.$$

So  $f(x) = 3x + 1$  is **uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$** .  $\square$

EXAMPLE 4.6. Is function  $g(x) = x^2$  uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ ?

**Solution.** Let us suppose that  $g(x) = x^2$  is uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ . Then  $\forall \epsilon > 0 \exists \delta > 0$  such that  $|g(x) - g(y)| < \epsilon$  for all  $x, y \in \mathbf{R}$  with  $|x - y| < \delta$ . However, if we choose (large numbers)  $x = N + \delta/2$  and  $y = N$  with  $N \in \mathbf{N}$  and  $N > 2\epsilon/\delta$ , then

$$|g(x) - g(y)| = |x - y||x + y| = \frac{\delta}{2}(2N + \frac{\delta}{2}) > \delta N > 2\epsilon,$$

a contradiction; therefore,  $g(x) = x^2$  is **not uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$** .  $\square$

By negating the definition of uniform continuity, we have the following criterion for nonuniform continuity.

**Theorem 4.11 (Sequential Criterion for Nonuniform Continuity).** *A function  $f: A \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  fails to be uniformly continuous on  $A$  if and only if there exist  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  and two sequences  $(x_n)$  and  $(y_n)$  in  $A$  satisfying  $|x_n - y_n| \rightarrow 0$  but  $|f(x_n) - f(y_n)| \geq \epsilon_0$ .*

EXAMPLE 4.7. The function  $h(x) = \sin(1/x)$  is continuous at every point in the open interval  $(0, 1)$ . Let

$$x_n = \frac{1}{2n\pi}, \quad y_n = \frac{1}{2n\pi + \frac{\pi}{2}} \quad \text{in } (0, 1);$$

then  $x_n - y_n \rightarrow 0$  but  $|h(x_n) - h(y_n)| = 1$ . So  $h(x)$  is not uniformly continuous on  $(0, 1)$ .

**Theorem 4.12 (Uniform continuity on compact sets).** *Every continuous function on a compact set  $K$  is uniformly continuous on  $K$ .*

**Proof.** Suppose  $f$  is not uniformly continuous on  $K$ . Then  $\exists \epsilon_0 > 0 \exists x_n, y_n \in K$  such that  $|x_n - y_n| \rightarrow 0$  but  $|f(x_n) - f(y_n)| \geq \epsilon_0$ . Since  $(x_n)$  is in  $K$  and  $K$  is compact, by definition of compact sets, there exists a convergent subsequence  $(x_{n_k})$  converging to a number  $x \in K$  as  $n_k \rightarrow \infty$ . We also have  $(y_{n_k}) \rightarrow x$  from  $|y_{n_k} - x| \leq |y_{n_k} - x_{n_k}| + |x_{n_k} - x| \rightarrow 0$  as  $n_k \rightarrow \infty$ . Hence, by continuity,  $f(x_{n_k}) \rightarrow f(x)$  and  $f(y_{n_k}) \rightarrow f(x)$  and so  $f(x_{n_k}) - f(y_{n_k}) \rightarrow 0$ ; this contradicts with  $|f(x_{n_k}) - f(y_{n_k})| \geq \epsilon_0$ .  $\square$

**Remark 4.3.** By Theorem 4.12, the function  $g(x) = x^2$  is uniformly continuous on all closed intervals  $[a, b]$  but is not uniformly continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$  (see Example 4.6). So, a function may be uniformly continuous on one set but not uniformly continuous on another set.

EXAMPLE 4.8. Let  $f$  be continuous on  $[0, \infty)$  and uniformly continuous on  $[b, \infty)$  for some  $b > 0$ . Show that  $f$  is uniformly continuous on  $[0, \infty)$ .

**Proof.** Use the uniform continuity of  $f$  on both  $[0, b]$  and  $[b, \infty)$ . Details are left as **Homework!**  $\square$

#### 4.4. The Intermediate Value Theorem

**Theorem 4.13 (Intermediate Value Theorem (IVT)).** *Let  $f: [a, b] \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be continuous and  $f(a) \neq f(b)$ . Assume  $L$  is a number between  $f(a)$  and  $f(b)$ . Then there exists a number  $c \in (a, b)$  where  $f(c) = L$ .*

**Proof.** We discuss a proof based on the (AoC); other proofs based on different properties of real numbers can be found in the text. To fix the idea, we assume  $f(a) < L < f(b)$  (the other case  $f(b) < L < f(a)$  can be treated similarly). Consider the set

$$K = \{x \in [a, b] : f(x) \leq L\}.$$

Since  $a \in K$ ,  $K$  is nonempty; since  $K \subseteq [a, b]$ ,  $K$  is bounded. Hence by the (AoC)  $c = \sup K$  exists. Since  $b$  is an upper-bound for  $K$ , we have  $c \leq b$ ; since  $a \in K$ , we have  $a \leq c$ . Hence  $c \in [a, b]$ . We prove that  $f(c) = L$ . Suppose  $f(c) \neq L$ ; then the following two cases would both reach a contradiction.

*Case 1:*  $f(c) < L$ . In this case,  $c \neq b$  and hence  $c < b$ . Take  $\epsilon = L - f(c)$  and, by continuity at  $c$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $f(c) - \epsilon < f(x) < f(c) + \epsilon$  for all  $x \in (c - \delta, c + \delta) \cap [a, b]$ . Let  $\delta_0 = \min\{\delta, b - c\}$ . Then  $c + \delta_0 \in (c - \delta, c + \delta) \cap [a, b]$  and so  $f(c + \delta_0) < f(c) + \epsilon = L$ ; hence  $c + \delta_0 \in K$ , a contradiction with  $c = \sup K$ .

*Case 2:*  $f(c) > L$ . In this case,  $c \neq a$  and hence  $c > a$ . Take  $\epsilon = f(c) - L$  and, by continuity at  $c$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $f(c) - \epsilon < f(x) < f(c) + \epsilon$  for all

$x \in (c - \delta, c + \delta) \cap [a, b]$ . Let  $0 < \delta_0 < \min\{c - a, \delta\}$ . Then  $c - \delta_0 > a$ ; hence  $[c - \delta_0, c] \subseteq (c - \delta, c + \delta) \cap [a, b]$  and so, for all  $x \in [c - \delta_0, c]$ ,  $f(x) > f(c) - \epsilon = L$ . This shows that  $x \notin K$  if  $x \in [c - \delta_0, c]$ . But  $K \subseteq [a, c]$  and hence  $K \subseteq [a, c - \delta_0]$  and hence  $c - \delta_0$  is an upper-bound for  $K$ , again a contradiction with  $c = \sup K$ .  $\square$

#### 4.5. Sets of Discontinuity for Monotone Functions

**Definition 4.6 (One-sided Limits).** Let  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be a given function. Let  $a \leq c < b$  and we say  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) = L$  if, for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$|f(x) - L| < \epsilon \quad \text{whenever } c < x < \min\{c + \delta, b\}.$$

Similarly, let  $a < c \leq b$  and we say  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) = L$  if, for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$|f(x) - L| < \epsilon \quad \text{whenever } \max\{a, c - \delta\} < x < c.$$

**Theorem 4.14.** Let  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c \in (a, b)$ . Then  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x)$  exists if and only if both  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$  and  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x)$  exist and are equal. In this case, all these limits are the same.

**Type of Discontinuity.** Let  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $c \in (a, b)$ . If  $f$  is discontinuous at  $c$ , then we have the following three cases:

- (a) **(Removable discontinuity)**  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x)$  exists but is not equal to  $f(c)$ .
- (b) **(Jump discontinuity)**  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$  and  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x)$  both exist but are not equal.
- (c) **(Essential discontinuity)** None of case (a) or (b) holds.

#### Sets of Discontinuity for Monotone Functions.

**Definition 4.7.** A function  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is said to be **increasing on**  $(a, b)$  (or **decreasing on**  $(a, b)$ ) if  $f(t) \leq f(s)$  (or  $f(t) \geq f(s)$ ) for all  $a < t < s < b$ . A function  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is called **monotone on**  $(a, b)$  if it is either increasing on  $(a, b)$  or decreasing on  $(a, b)$ .

**Theorem 4.15.** The set of discontinuity of a monotone function on  $(a, b)$  is at most countable.

**Proof.** Without loss of generality, assume  $f: (a, b) \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is increasing. Let

$$S = \{c \in (a, b) : f \text{ is discontinuous at } c\}.$$

Assume  $S \neq \emptyset$ . We show that at every  $c \in S$  the function  $f$  has a jump discontinuity. First show that both  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x)$  and  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$  exist and satisfy that

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) \leq f(c) \leq \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x).$$

**(Homework!)** But  $f$  can not have a removable discontinuity because, if  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x)$  exists, then  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = f(c)$  and hence  $f$  is continuous at  $c$ . Therefore, every point  $c \in S$  is a jump discontinuity of  $f$  with  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) < \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$ . We now define a function  $h: S \rightarrow \mathbf{Q}$  as follows. Given  $c \in S$ , since  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) < \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$ , we take any rational number  $r$  with

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) < r < \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x)$$

and define  $h(c) = r$ . This defines a function  $h: S \rightarrow \mathbf{Q}$ . We show that  $h$  is one-to-one. Let  $c, d \in S$  and  $c < d$ . We show that  $h(c) < h(d)$ . This follows from the inequalities:

$$h(c) < \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) \leq \lim_{x \rightarrow d^-} f(x) < h(d).$$

**(Homework!)** Since  $h: S \rightarrow \mathbf{Q}$  is one-to-one and  $\mathbf{Q}$  is countable, it follows that  $S$  is at most countable.  $\square$